Consultation and consent as markers of changing relationships: a perspective from *Eeyou Istchee*

Jill Elaine Torrie

Public Health Department
Cree Board of Health and Social Services of James Bay
Consultation and consent as markers of change

• Change from both sides: university & Indigenous groups
• Not driven by social science
• Simple model from clinical services to represent this change
• Model from social work to explain the shift
Simple model from clinical services to represent the change in relationship between researchers and Indigenous groups.
Figure 2  Approches disciplinaires en fonction de leur sémantique

Prefixes → Uni  Intra  Pluri  Multi  Inter  Trans

Intensité → Absent  Faible  Fort

des interactions
The Uni-approach

Dominant positivistic notion of ‘the other’ as a research object to be studied

Social science not driver of change

Power imbalance within research
Figure 2 - Approches disciplinaires en fonction de leur sémantique

Préfixes → Uni  Intra  Pluri  Multi  Inter  Trans

Intensité → Absent  Faible  Fort
des interactions
The Trans-approach

Constructivist approaches (CBPR)

Relationships cemented through explicit partnerships

Empowerment of Indigenous groups
Empowerment

The power to act (Le Bossé)
This is all relatively new

• Post WWII:
  • New societal value to promote science
  • Expansion of universities

• With public demand (outrage) gov’ts formalised the ethical issues in research
  • New discourse around values
  • Continued evidence of abuses (up to today)
  • Universities had to follow
  • Note: university-business linkages taking place at same time
How new is the norm around research consent?

• 1947 – Nuremberg Code: informed consent

• 1964 – Helsinki Declaration of World Medical Association

• 1974 - National Research Act (USA) National Commission for the Protection of Human Subjects of Biomedical and Behavioural Research
  • All research should be reviewed by an IRB

• 1979 – Belmont Report of the Commission

• 1991 – Common Rule (USA) of all gov’t departments

• 1998 – Canadian Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ch. 6 Aboriginal Research
1998 – Canadian Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ch. 6 Aboriginal Research
   • Revisions to Policy Statement  2010, 2014

2004 – background document on Aboriginal Research focused on clash of values, interests, intent
   • unequal power relations in research
   • knowledge contexts
   • ethical space

2007 – paper by Glass & Kaufert on how REBs could address issue of collective rights within an ethics review process based on individualistic decision-making
   • REBs have trouble with qualitative, participatory, and Aboriginal research
   • Formal research agreements at outset
   • Cultural competency within REBs
   • Goal of culturally safe research
Meanwhile the situation of Indian Native Aboriginal First Nations Indigenous peoples was changing
Change happened in the areas of:

• unequal power relations in research
• knowledge contexts
• ethical space

Change led to:

• Political dimensions
• New normative constructions of social relationships defined as unjust
• Articulation of values
"Intervention" - a model from social work

Ce que nous appelons communément aujourd’hui “intervention sociale” ce sont les multiples pratiques (professionnelles ou non) qui, par le recadrage et l’emprise de l’État, deviennent des leviers que celui-ci se donne dans sa volonté de maîtrise des problèmes sociaux. Dans notre société libérale, l’État est le sujet de l’intervention sociale, et la société civile, dans ses lieux problématiques, en est l’objet. (Nélisse 1993 : 169)

What we commonly call today "social intervention" are the multiple practices (professional or not) which, by the reframing and the influence of the State, become levers it uses to control social problems. In our liberal society, the state is the subject of social intervention, and civil society, in its problematic areas, is the subject. (1993: 169)
The interveners

• finding a solution to a concrete problem posed by someone else and this is the first and central significance of the intervention
• theory is practical
• social research in this context is a method of intervention working both ways:
  • Problematic of the marginalised Indigenous group facing mining internationals
  • Problematic of the University with its dissonant values
Thank you!

Chiniskumitin
Thank you!